



# Domestic Homicide Review Tamana 2018 Overview Report

Author: Andrew Rabey

Commissioned by: Kent Community Safety Partnership Medway Community Safety Partnership

Review Completed: 26th October 2020

"I originally come from Afghanistan where the notion of law and abiding it is afar distant reality for people, where usually vulnerable people's rights are stamped upon by the rich and powerful individuals. Similarly, in that society women are seen as second-class citizens where further and higher education will only be available to a few who face the social stigma, challenges, and threats. I therefore want to study and send a message that everything is achievable and possible despite all the challenges. I am sure every dream can become a reality with hard work and that is something I am ready to take on."

Tamana.

These words are those of Tamana and were written by her as a part of her university application to study Law. The Panel felt that they should be at the forefront of the report as they present through her own words the aspirations she held for her future.

# Table of Contents

1	Introduction	4
2	The Review Process	5
3	The Death of Tamana	9
4	Background Information	11
5	Chronology	13
6	Overview	18
7.	Analysis	22
8.	Conclusions	26
9	Lessons to be learnt	28
10	Recommendations	29
Apı	pendix A	31
Apı	Appendix B	
U	IK Organisations supporting Muslim Women & Girls	36
Apı	Appendix C	
Е	Engagement with Muslim Young People in Modern UK	
Glo	ssary	41

# Domestic Homicide Review Tamana

# 1 Introduction

- 1.1. The key purpose of a Domestic Homicide Review (DHR) is to:
  - a) Establish what lessons are to be learned from the domestic homicide regarding the way in which local professionals and organisations work individually and together to safeguard victims;
  - b) Identify clearly what those lessons are both within and between agencies, how and within what timescales they will be acted on, and what is expected to change as a result;
  - c) Apply these lessons to service responses including changes to inform national and local policies and procedures as appropriate;
  - d) prevent domestic violence and homicide and improve service responses for all domestic violence and abuse victims and their children by developing a co- ordinated multi-agency approach to ensure that domestic abuse is identified and responded to effectively at the earliest opportunity;
  - e) Contribute to a better understanding of the nature of domestic violence and abuse; and
  - f) Highlight good practice.

# 1.2 Scope

This DHR examines the contact and involvement that organisations had with Tamana between 1<sup>st</sup> November 2011 and the date of her death in December 2018

In order to meet its purpose, this DHR also examines the contact and involvement that organisations had with Shamas

# 1.3 <u>Terms of Reference</u>

The terms of reference for the DHR are set out in *Appendix A* to this report.

# **Timescales**

This review began on 6<sup>th</sup> March 2019 following the decision made by the Core Group panel members that the case met the criteria for conducting a DHR. The review was commissioned by the Chair of the Kent Community Safety Partnership on 29<sup>th</sup> January 2019.

In December 2018, police officers were called to a flat in Town A. They discovered the body of Tamana lying on the kitchen floor. A knife and a large amount of blood was also present. She was the victim of a ferocious and sustained knife attack in her kitchen resulting in numerous wounds.

Tamana's husband, Shamas was arrested the same day and was subsequently charged with her murder and remanded in custody until the Court Hearing.

In April 2019 at Crown Court Shamas pleaded guilty to the murder of Tamana. He offered no evidence or mitigation and was sentenced to 16 years and 82 days imprisonment.

# 2 The Review Process

- 2.1 Methodology
- 2.1.1 This Overview Report is an anthology of information gathered from Independent Management Reports (IMRs) prepared by representatives of the organisations that had contact and involvement with Tamana and/or Shamas between 1st November 2011 and Tamana's death.
- 2.1.2 A letter was sent to senior managers in each of the agencies or bodies identified within the scope of the review, requesting the commissioning of IMRs. The aim of the IMR is to:
  - a. Allow agencies to look openly and critically at individual and organisational practice and the context within which professionals were working (i.e. culture, leadership, supervision, training etc.) to see whether the homicide indicates that practice needs to be changed or improved to support the highest standards of work by professionals.
  - b. Identify how and when those changes or improvements will be brought about.
  - c. Identify good practice within agencies.
  - d. Provide an independent assessment by ensuring the individual responsible for the IMR has not had involvement with anyone who is subject of the review. The IMR is signed off by a senior manager of that organisation before being submitted to the DHR review panel.
- 2.1.3 Each of the following organisations completed an IMR or a short information report (if IMR is not required) for this DHR:
  - Kent Police
  - Clinical Commissioning Group
  - Town A Borough Council
  - Kent Education Safeguarding
  - Humberside Police

- Town B Clinical Commissioning Group
- Town B Social Care/Looked after Children's team
- University Teaching Hospitals NHS Trust Town B
- 2.1.4 In each of the different agencies IMRs, interaction with Tamana and/or Shamas was recorded. In the main IMRs completed by agencies in Kent related to Tamana, while the IMRs completed by agencies in Town B related exclusively to Shamas.

# 2.2 Contributors to the Review

2.2.1 The review panel consisted of an Independent Chair and senior representatives of the organisations that had relevant contact with Tamana and/or Shamas. The IMR authors and DHR Review Panel members have not had any direct involvement with Tamana or Shamas and have not been the immediate line manager of any staff involved with them. This included a senior member of Kent Community Safety Team. In addition, a senior member of a Domestic Abuse Charity was invited to sit on the board. Several attempts were made to contact the Border Agency to invite them to join the Panel or contribute to the review. However, no reply was received in each of the attempts made.

# 2.2.2 The members of the panel were:

Name	Job Title & Agency
DI lan Wadey	Kent Police
Shafick Peerbux	Head of Community Safety Kent County Council Community Safety
Andrew Rabey	Independent Chair
Henu Cummins	Chief Executive Officer Domestic Abuse Volunteer Support Services
Kulbir Pasricha	Manager Kent Police Community Engagement & Hate Crime
Catherine Collins	Strategic Safeguarding Manager Kent County Council Adult Safeguarding
Lesley Gould	Service Manager Kent County Council Integrated Children's Service
Claire Ray	Head of Service The Education People commissioned by Kent County Council
Claire Axon-Peters	Designated Professional for Safeguarding Adults Clinical Commissioning Group
Goumana Synadinou	Independent Panel Member
Rich Clarke	Head of Audit Partnership Town A Borough Council
Shafi Khan	Kent Independent Advisory Group
Vicki Paddison	Strategic Domestic Abuse Service Manager

Name	Job Title & Agency
	Town B City Council

- 2.2.3 The Independent Chair of the review panel is a retired senior Police Officer having retired in 2014. He has experience and knowledge of domestic abuse issues and legislation, along with a clear understanding of the roles and responsibilities of those involved in the multi-agency approach to dealing with domestic abuse. He has a background in serious crime investigation, reviews, multi-agency panel working groups and the chairing of strategic and multi- agency meetings. He has been an Independent Chair for Domestic Homicide Reviews since 2015, and is also a trustee of two charities, one being a domestic abuse charity. The Independent Chair has no connection with the Community Safety Partnership other than being commissioned to undertake Domestic Homicide Reviews and Safeguarding Adult Reviews.
- 2.2.4 It was reported that Tamana was working in two locations at the time of her death. The review hoped to add further context from Tamana's employer however upon making contact with these employers it was found that she had not started work at either location. Therefore, no information relevant to this review was available.
- 2.2.5. The complex nature of the relationship between Tamana and Shamas was discussed at length by the panel. Although the arrangements made by family members for their marriage was quite usual in their culture, the length of and lack of contact during the engagement was considered to be challenging for a young couple in any circumstances. Both lived separate lives to each other with a sizable geographical distance between them. They lived in cultural settings significantly different from those they had originated, and in which extended family members still lived and continued to make decisions about their lives. The panel also carefully considered whether inviting a contribution from Shamas to the review could provide additional information that would be helpful in the understanding of the events surrounding Tamana's death. The panel were clear that in inviting Shamas to contribute, that this would not in any way deflect from the horror of Tamana's death, nor would it be a main focus of the review. On balance it was felt that this additional perspective could provide additional opportunities for reflection and learning. To progress this the Probation services was contacted seeking advice about the intended action. It was agreed that Shamas' key worker would speak to him to explain the review process, and he agreed for a letter of approach to be sent. The Independent Chair wrote to Shamas in October 2019, the letter contained information about the review process and invited him to contribute. Shamas received the letter and discussed it with his probation officer. Probation Services confirmed that Shamas declined the invitation to contribute to the review.
- 2.2.6. For the period Shamas lived in the UK, he has almost exclusively lived in Town B, Humberside. The Panel felt it important to identify whether there was any information available from that area that could assist with the review. The Independent Chair contacted a member of the Community Safety Partnership in Town B, and it was agreed that Individual Management Reports would be provided by agencies who had had involvement with Shamas since his entry into the UK. The Independent Chair met

with representatives of the agencies to discuss the findings of those reports and a representative member from Town B Community Safety Partnership remains a part of the panel.

# 2.3 Review Meetings

2.3.1 The review panel initially met on 6<sup>th</sup> March 2019 to discuss the terms of reference, which were then agreed by correspondence. The review panel then met on 30<sup>th</sup> July 2019 to consider the IMRs, and again on the 6<sup>th</sup> December 2019 when the draft Overview Report was considered, and amendments agreed. A further meeting was held on 7<sup>th</sup> February 2020. This was to agree the recommendations and action plan.

# 2.4 Family and Friends Involvement

2.4.1 The review panel considered which family members, friends, and members of the community should be consulted and involved in the review process. Consideration was also given to the involvement of the perpetrator's family. Due to the fact they live in Afghanistan it was decided this was not practical. The panel was made aware of the following family members and friends. All names of family and friends have been anonymised. The panel carefully considered the use of pseudonyms and with the help of the cultural advisors within the panel agreed upon the following names. The family have read the Overview Report and did not raise any concerns over the pseudonyms that were selected.

Name	Relationship with Tamana
Aris	Father
Masoma	Mother
Zabih	Brother
Malika	Sister
Younger Sibling	
Younger Sibling	

2.4.2 The Independent Chair met with family members at their home on 10<sup>th</sup> June 2019. He was introduced by the Family Liaison Officer. The family were extremely welcoming of him and in line with their traditional custom provided refreshments. The Independent Chair was only afforded the opportunity to meet male members of the family and they were very keen to hear about his role and how they might engage in the process. He explained this and the requirement of the DHR process. He also explained how support could be afforded to the family throughout the review process and the work of AAFDA (Advocacy After Fatal Domestic Abuse) and how as an independent charity they can offer support and guidance. They were invited to contribute to the review, and it was

explained how they could do this. The Independent Chair said to them that he was keen to involve the experience and views of close family and friends. As part of his bid to engage with family members, and in recognition of the difficulties female family members might have in meeting with him, he offered the opportunity for them to meet with a female panel member from a similar background, however this offer was declined. He advised that he would later write providing further details about the review and enclose a Home Office DHR information leaflet. On 23rd July 2019 letters were sent by recorded delivery to all family members, these were sent in both English and also translated into their own language as the panel were aware that for some family members speaking English remained a challenge. Feedback received from the family informed the Chair that they had decided that they did not wish to contribute to the review. The reason provided was that they found the loss of Tamana too painful to discuss further. No other friends were identified or came forward to contribute to the review. As a result, the panel undertook a proportionate review based upon the information available. Whilst this decision and request for privacy was respected, it cannot be ignored that this has impacted on the level of information gathered and our ability to fully understand the circumstances leading up to Tamana's tragic death. It is noted that support was being provided to the family during this difficult time through local support services and statutory agencies.

2.4.3 The Chair of the panel again wrote to family members on 7<sup>th</sup> August 2020 and where requested left them each with a copy of the report. On 2<sup>nd</sup> September 2020 a family representative contacted the chair and said that they were content with the report and did not wish to make any changes or discuss it further. The Independent Chair and panel members acknowledged how difficult this was for all who offered help in learning lessons from Tamana's death, and the panel wished to put on record their condolences to the family, friends, and all of those affected by this tragic event.

# 3 The Death of Tamana

# 3.1 Events surrounding the Death of Tamana

- 3.1.1 In late December 2018 Tamana's younger sibling, was found outside the flat where Tamana and Shamas had recently moved. They were alone, distressed and confused. The neighbours who found Tamana's sibling did not know them and subsequently called the Police. Enquiries located his family home and Police spoke to his parents who said they had been trying to contact Tamana but could not get a reply.
- 3.1.2 Police Officers attended Tamana's flat. There they discovered the body of Tamana lying on the kitchen floor. A knife and a large amount of blood was also present. She was the victim of a ferocious and sustained knife attack in her kitchen resulting in numerous wounds.
- 3.1.3 Her husband Shamas was subsequently tracked down having left the area in his car. He was arrested, charged and detained in custody. At Crown Court Shamas pleaded guilty to the murder of Tamana. He offered no evidence or mitigation and was

sentenced to 16 years and 82 days imprisonment.

# 3.1.4 In summing up the trial Judge said,

"You took Tamana's life in her new home, when she was (only a young adult) You therefore deprived her of all future joys and potential accomplishments to which she had been looking forward. In that regard I note from the statements made by some of her teachers who spoke very highly of her, and forecast a successful future for her, that she had done well at school and had been accepted at university to study a degree in law – Indeed I have had a chance to read the personal statement which she submitted with her application. It together with what I know of her from other statements, suggest someone who would surely have been a bright light in her year group. You also wrenched her from her immediate family in the most unexpected and brutal of fashions, depriving them of a daughter and sister, thereby inflicting on her parents and siblings a degree of pain and suffering so sudden and extreme that it will surely live with them forever."

# 3.2 Equality and Diversity

3.2.1 The report addressed the nine protected characteristics (age, disability including learning disability, gender reassignment, marriage and civil partnerships, pregnancy and maternity, race, religion and belief, ethnicity, sex and sexual orientation) as prescribed in the public sector Equalities Act duties and considered if they were relevant to any aspect of this review.

The review considers whether access to services or the delivery of services were impacted upon by such issues, and if any adverse inference could be drawn from the negligence of services towards persons to whom the characteristics were relevant.

- 3.2.2 At the initial Terms of Reference meeting the Chair discussed with the panel the cultural make-up of the members in relation to Tamana, her family and Shamas, and it was agreed in a bid to ensure a better understanding of the specific cultural and religious beliefs, customs and practices, that representation from the Muslim community should be sought to join the panel. It was also felt important to include a panel member of a similar age, gender and background to assist in the understanding of any additional issues or pressures that may have existed for Tamana and/or Shamas. As a consequence, two additional members joined the panel who had a similar background, lived experience and knowledge of the community and culture that Tamana and Shamas lived in.
- 3.2.3 It was acknowledged from the outset, and from the initial information provided that culture, upbringing, and customs would form an important part of this review. In preparation for this, and to increase awareness, the Independent Chair arranged for IMR writers and Panel members to be provided with a briefing, which offered valuable insights and background information into the culture and religious beliefs of Tamana and her family, and gave some context into the community in which they lived. It also identified how the interpretation of Muslim teaching and local culture differed within

families, communities and across the world. The presentation also detailed information around harmful practices including honour-based abuse and forced marriages. The panel felt that in undertaking this review they should consider these differences in the context of the individual circumstances and whether it impacted upon the relationship between Tamana and Shamas, and her subsequent death.

- 3.2.4 The panel agreed that a wider understanding of the experience of being a young female Muslim today would be useful to the panel. It was felt that it would help evaluate and provide greater understanding of the lived experience and additional difficulties that may exist in balancing ambition and family expectation. The panel agreed to the use of a survey which would be directed at self-defined female Muslims aged 18 years to 24 years. Two female panel members agreed to conduct the research. Initially surveys were sent to community contacts and Community Liaison Officers. The surveys were conducted using a variety of means, focus groups were formed for the questions and answer sessions and views recorded. In some cases, telephone and E mail were used for persons unable to attend the focus groups. Surveys were sent out to Community Liaison Officers (CLO). CLO are employees of Kent Police. Their role is to work closely with community groups and build links and an understanding of the community they represent. The CLOs distributed the surveys, thirty-one surveys were completed although it is unknown how many were distributed. It is further understood that some of the responses were from young Muslim men who were part of the community groups spoken to. The responses provided a wide range of views and these are presented within Appendix C. In addition, the use of feedback forms from two conference presentations carried out by one of the panel members was used to gain a further insight of views. The presentations were to a wider audience mainly made up of women from different ethnic and religious backgrounds. (All of the resulting information is contained within appendix C)
- 3.2.5 The imam from Tamana's local mosque, where she and her family worshiped, was invited to contribute, and his views recorded in a short report. He was able to provide valuable insight into the cultural and religious aspects of Tamana life. He also expressed the shock and significant feeling of loss felt within the Muslim community in Town A following Tamana's brutal death. (Details of the imam's views are contained within the Overview 7.1)

# 4 Background Information

# 4.1 <u>Tamana</u>

- 4.1.1 Tamana's father, Aris, came to the UK in 2001 from Afghanistan, where he had been born and raised. Shamas and Tamana were cousins and grew up in the same house in Afghanistan.
- 4.1.2 Aris's wife, Masoma and their children Tamana, Zabih, and Malika remained in Afghanistan until 2011 when they moved to the UK. Two further children were born to the family following the move to the UK.

- 4.1.3 Tamana could not speak English at the time she arrived in the UK. She however attended a local school and within a few months she had learnt English and could hold a good conversation. Her school records indicate that she was a child who had a positive approach to learning, that she thrived in the school environment, grew in confidence, and soon became very ambitious about her future. She was also described as a young woman who had a good sense of humour. She was highly regarded by the school, not just in terms of her character, but also in her academic achievements. She had an inquisitive mind, and she was not afraid to speak her mind and disagree with others on particular issues. She had strong morals and had a strong sense of right and wrong. Tamana was confident in her own abilities and had clearly thought out ambitions for her future life.
- 4.1.4 Tamana and her family are Shia Muslim. They regularly attended their local mosque. They have a traditional approach to their faith and followed a culture instilled while growing up and living in Afghanistan. Tamana was described as being protective of her father and had a close relationship with her mother. She supported her younger siblings and sometimes collected them from school. There was a strong sense that the family were very close and supportive of each other. Tamana's parents did not speak English well and at school parent's evenings Tamana would interpret for them.
- 4.1.5 Tamana was described as being proud of her culture. At school she always wore school uniform and a head scarf. When she was able to wear her own clothes to school, she chose to wear clothes representing her culture. School staff were aware of her religion and Tamana took part in Ramadan and Eid and took time out of school to celebrate these festivals. When her peers asked about her beliefs and customs, it is stated that she was always confident and willing to share and discuss these with them.

# 4.2 Shamas

- 4.2.1 Shamas is Aris's nephew, and his father continues to live in Afghanistan. In 2007 Shamas came to the UK and moved to Town B Humberside. At the time of entering the UK Shamas declared that he was 15 years old and had left Afghanistan to escape a blood feud. An assessment of his age at the time, whilst disputed, was assessed as being 15 years, and his year of birth was given as 1991. Following the assessment Shamas' solicitor made a claim for asylum as a child and he was granted leave to remain until his 18th birthday. During the police investigation it was established that Shamas' year of birth was 1986. This meant that Shamas was in fact an adult at his time of entry into the UK.
- 4.2.2 Shamas made a claim for asylum under fear of persecution if he returned to Afghanistan. He stated that his father was a member of the Taliban. He said his father had subsequently been shot dead, and he had been threatened that when he became an adult he too would be killed. For their safety Shamas stated that he and his family were moved to Pakistan by an uncle, where his mother re married but he was regularly beaten by his stepfather. He left the home to live with another uncle, but instead he provided him with a passport and air ticket to Paris. From Paris, Shamas found his way to a port, at

- which he hid in a lorry and came to the UK. From the evidence provided during the Police investigation we know that Shamas' father was in fact alive and they were in regular contact with each other during that period.
- 4.2.3 Shamas was given discretionary leave to remain as a minor until he reached the age of 18 years.
- 4.2.4 In 2007 Shamas was placed in a children's home. He was accommodated under section 20 of the Childrens Act 1989. Shamas complained that he did not like the children's home and made frequent requests to be re accommodated. In 2008 Shamas was provided with supported accommodation through the local authority. He was supported in furnishing a flat and further supported by the local housing provider. Shamas appeared to be settled and regularly attended college and worked part time in local take away restaurants.
- 4.2.5 In 2010 Shamas applied for permanent leave to remain in the UK. In 2012 Shamas informed his social worker that he has been granted 3 years leave to remain. At the time of Tamana's death Shamas had been granted permanent leave to remain in the UK
- 4.2.6 Shamas attended the local mosque in Town B and was part of a friendship group with others of a similar situation to his own.

# 5 Chronology

- 5.1 This section considers, in detail, the contact and involvement that Tamana and/or Shamas had with agencies during the period covered by the terms of reference. The facts are based on; IMRs submitted by organisations and limited information provided by the Police investigation.
- 5.2 In 2011 Tamana together with her mother and siblings moved from Afghanistan to the UK to join her father who had lived and worked in the UK since 2001.
- 5.3 In 2011 Shamas was being supported by Young Peoples support services. (YPSS) In January he requested support in applying for permanent leave to remain from the Home Office. In June reports show that he was coping well living independently and was awaiting a decision about his application to remain in the UK.
- 5.4 In December 2011 an allegation of sexual assault was made against Shamas. The allegation made was that he had grabbed the buttocks of a female while she was dancing with her friend in a bar. He was arrested and interviewed by Police Officers. However, no further action was taken as the victim declined to support a prosecution.
- 5.5 In January 2012 Tamana started secondary school in Town A. Upon starting school, she spoke a very limited amount of English. She soon overcame any language barriers and quickly learnt to speak fluent English.
- 5.6 In May 2012 Shamas was seen by YPSS and was happy that he had been granted 3

years leave to remain in the UK. He also said that he was intending to move to another county as he had a friend living in Town A. He planned to find a job and continue college there. Shamas went to Town A on 3 separate occasions over a 6-month period seeking work and accommodation. On each occasion he returned to Town B stating that he had been unsuccessful. This caused him to become depressed and he subsequently visited his GP. In December 2012 Shamas received support to find accommodation and as a result obtained a tenancy in Town B.

- 5.7 In April 2013 Shamas contacted YPSS. He asked for support in renewing his leave to remain in the UK, despite having two years still granted. He was told that he could not apply for further leave to remain until a month before the end of the period granted.
- 5.8 In April 2014 following an agreement between their respective parents Shamas and Tamana, aged 15, became engaged to be married. Following this, and until their marriage in 2018, Tamana and Shamas spoke regularly by phone and occasionally Shamas would visit Tamana at her home in Town A.
- 5.9 In September 2014 Tamana was complaining of lower back pain. Upon seeking medical attention, it was considered that she may have a fractured vertebra in her lower spine. Further investigations were carried out and it was found to be a severe deficiency of vitamin D. Vitamin B12 was administered.
- 5.10 In August 2015 Tamana attended her GP for a routine check of her vitamin D levels. The levels of vitamin D continued to be low. The GP observed that Tamana lacked exposure to the sun, possibly as a consequence of her cultural values in dress, and her dislike of oily fish which was impacting on this low level.
- 5.11 In 2015 Tamana was in Year 10, at her school. She informed her teachers that she wished to pursue a career in medicine. As a result, she had some work experience at a hospice. Her teachers said that she had enjoyed this very much.
- 5.12 In 2016 while Tamana was engaged in her GCSE exams she was encouraged to apply for college places as her predicted grades were not sufficient to remain in the sixth form. However, Tamana exceeded these and gained 8 GCSE passes and obtained a place in the sixth form of her choice. This was acknowledged to be a great personal achievement, considering only a few years earlier she could not speak any English. Tamana was described by her teachers as being very pleased with her achievements.
- 5.13 In April 2016 Shamas attended his GP complaining of chest pains but no issues were discovered. A week later he was examined in Rapid Access Chest Pain Clinic, no cardiac issues were detected.
- 5.14 In July 2016 Tamana attended her GP. She complained of pains in her right arm and shoulder. This was severe enough that she could not lift her arm. The cause of the injury was unknown and Tamana was referred for an x-ray at the end of July. She did not attend the appointment, but it was considered that the joint pains were a symptom

- of her continuing vitamin D deficiency.
- 5.15 In July 2016 Shamas attended his GP surgery to have the vaccinations required for travelling to Afghanistan. He was going to visit his father and brother who he had not seen for 10 years.
- 5.16 In September 2016 Tamana was 17 years old and started year 13 at school. She spoke to the careers lead and said that she had decided on a career in law. The career lead said that this was a surprise as in her view it did not suit Tamana's personality. She asked Tamana why she wanted to pursue this particular career and she said it was what her father wanted. She had realised that she would not get the grades required to become a doctor. The careers lead assisted Tamana in writing her personal statement. She asked her to focus upon what she would do if she had a Law degree. Tamana said that if successful she would help the disadvantaged and in particular oppressed women.
- 5.17 School reports indicate that Tamana rarely spoke about her personal circumstances or personal relationships. However, when Tamana was in Years 12 and 13 her father was ill and had a number of hospital admissions. The school reports being aware of this and stated that Tamara was concerned for him, clearly demonstrating a closeness between them. On one occasion in Year 13 Tamana spoke about her relationship with Shamas. She told a member of staff that she was going to meet a cousin she had grown up with and that they were getting married. She gave no indication how she felt about this, the report presents it as a simple statement of fact and provides no commentary or observation about whether she appeared happy or unhappy about this arrangement. It was not mentioned again.
- 5.18 In January 2017 Shamas attended his GP and records show that he requested a Hepatitis B vaccination as he had contracted it while in Afghanistan. He stated that he had a wife and that she too had Hepatitis B. Shamas also sought treatment for a sexually transmitted infection.
- 5.19 In August 2017 Tamana attended her GP for a routine appointment regarding her vitamin D levels. The GP records indicate that Tamana was advised that her low levels of vitamin D, and the aches and pains she was experiencing were due to a lack of sunlight. She was advised to get 2 4 hours sun exposure to her limbs, without sun block, before midday and after 3pm during the summer. She was also prescribed Glucosamine for her joint pain. However, the GP records indicate that Tamana did not appear to be convinced of the proposed treatment.
- 5.20 In December 2017 Shamas attended hospital following an assault. Shamas was a taxi driver and he stated that he had been assaulted by a passenger. He suffered bruising to the bridge of his nose, was discharged and was advised to take pain killers. There are no records to indicate this was reported to the police.
- 5.21 In June 2018 Tamana received her public examinations results:

BTEC subsidiary Diploma in Public Services (Distinction)

BTEC Extended Certificate in Health and Social Care (Distinction) AQA level

3 Extended Certificate in Applied Business (Merit)

Tamana was offered a place at a university to study law.

- 5.22 Tamana left school in the Summer of 2018. On the day the results were heard staff at the school described Tamana as very happy and clearly excited at the prospect of going to university. Later that summer a reference request was received by the school for her regarding a job at Tesco, indicating that her course at university must have been put on hold. Staff remember feeling not just surprised, but also shocked, as Tamana had been so focused and self- determined. They understood her to have had her family's support and knew how hard she had studied to achieve her ambitions.
- 5.23 In July 2018 Tamana submitted an online housing application. She cited that she was living with her parents and siblings in an overcrowded environment. That they were all living in one room together and that it was in a poor state of repair.
- 5.24 In July 2018 Tamana attended her GP surgery in preparation for her marriage to Shamas in Afghanistan. She was given vaccinations against Diphtheria, Tetanus, and Polio as a routine measure. She was also given Hepatitis A and Typhoid as she was in a high-risk group.
- 5.25 It was discovered during the Police investigation into Tamana's death that the relationship between Shamas and her father had changed in the months before the wedding. It was reported that Shamas' attitude towards Aris had become rude and insulting. Zabih, Tamana's brother, had stated that his father had tried to stop the marriage going ahead but was told by other family members that it must.
- 5.26 In August 2018 Tamana and Shamas travelled to Afghanistan where they were married. For a short time after the wedding they remained in Afghanistan, staying with Shamas' family. They returned to the UK in September 2018 where upon Tamana went back to her parents' home and Shamas returned to Town B. Aris, Tamana's father, understood that Shamas had returned to Town B to sell his car and house before returning to his wife in Town A. (see glossary and explanation of terms with regard to marriages outside the UK)
- 5.27 During the police investigation into Tamana's death Zabih explained that their family did not want her to move to Town B, stating it was too far away and that she would have very little family support. However, later reports to police following Tamana's death show that he and his family were concerned for Tamana's safety. This was because Shamas had been displaying aggressive behaviour towards his father-in-law.
- 5.28 While Shamas was in Town B he and Tamana regularly exchanged texts and spoke on the phone to each other on a daily basis. Shamas tried to persuade Tamana to move with him to Town B, but her family were insistent that he should move to Town A.

- 5.29 In September 2018 Tamana contacted the housing provider in Town A enquiring as to the position of her housing application. Tamana stated that she was unhappy with the time it was taking to process her application and asked to make a complaint. Later in the same month she received notification that her application had been accepted and that she could now apply for appropriate vacant properties. Between the months of October and November 2018 Tamana made bids for 12 properties but was unsuccessful on each. In December 2018 Tamana contacted the housing provider to inform them that she had obtained a property through a private application.
- 5.30 In October 2018 Tamana contacted a member of staff at her previous school telling them that she had not gone to university as planned the previous year, but now wanted to re-apply. She said the reason she did not take the place offered previously was because she had been helping her Mother and younger siblings. Tamana was supported with her second university application to study law, which she sent to five universities.
- 5.31 In November 2018 having sold his car Shamas moved to Town A and into the family home. No arguments or abusive behaviours were reported. However, on one occasion Zabih heard raised voices from Tamana and Shamas in their bedroom. He heard Tamana say "I love my father more than anyone else. I'll do anything he says".
- 5.32 Police reports from Aris obtained during the investigation into Tamana's death show that Tamana had spoken to him about a call Shamas had received from his father in Afghanistan. In the call he was urged to return to Town B, taking Tamana with him, and that if she refused for him to divorce her. Despite this he said that Tamana had reassured him that they were happy together. Aris also reported another incident that Tamana shared which occurred when Shamas was still living in Town B. Shamas had challenged Tamana as to why her father had not stood up to an uncle, (her mother's brother) when he had been disrespectful to her mother. Shamas said that her father should have slapped him. He added that if it had been him, he would have made holes in the uncle with a knife. Aris stated that when Shamas moved to Town A, Shamas apologised to Tamana for the comments he had made and said that he would not do it.
- 5.33 Zabih shared that Tamana had been open with family members of her ambitions for her future, that she wanted to be well educated, to study Law, and had aspirations to one day become a Judge. Shamas told him that he was against this, and that what he wanted was for Tamana not to work, and not to do any further study. Zabih believed that Shamas wanted to control Tamana.
- 5.34 In November 2018 Tamana contacted her GP by telephone with regards to pains in her kidneys. She told the GP that whilst abroad a few months earlier she had had a scan of her kidneys. This had shown some irregularities and had been advised to have a repeat scan. The GP agreed to refer her on for further investigation.
- 5.35 In December 2018 Tamana called the out of hours GP services suffering from lower back pain. The call was made while en route to hospital, so an agreement was made to

call back following the hospital visit. A couple of days later Tamana attended her GP stating a lower back fracture, describing the symptoms as very similar to those reported two years previously only the pain and discomfort had increased. The GP could not find any evidence of a fracture, and concluded ongoing joint pain considered to be associated with low vitamin D levels.

- 5.36 In December 2018 Tamana contacted her GP practice requesting birth control.
  Tamana explained that she did not want to be given the pill but wanted an implant.
  Tamana was advised to attend the family planning clinic.
- 5.37 In December 2018 Aris asked Shamas to leave the family home. At some point following this he moved into the property obtained by Tamana, initially by himself. It remains unclear as to when Tamana moved in with Shamas, however both her father and brother Zabih stated that she moved in a week before her death. It is however clear from text messages obtained during the police investigation that there was a reluctance by Tamana to move in with Shamas as she stated that she did not trust him. During this time Tamana's text show that she asked Shamas to change the carpets in the flat and then she would move in. A few days later several messages demonstrate that Shamas wanted Tamana to move in with him, but she was still reluctant stating a lack of trust being the reason.
- 5.38 Later in December 2018 Tamana stayed with Shamas. The following day neighbours reported loud arguments between a male and female coming from the premises. Some hours later Tamana's younger sibling was found outside the property alone. The police were called.

# 6 Overview

- 6.1 The Independent Chair invited the imam from the mosque in Town A to contribute to the review. This provided interesting and valuable insights into the community in which Tamana, and her family lived. Although the Independent Chair made initial introductory contact with Tamana's family, it had not been possible to engage with the family further during this review, as it was their wish not to contribute, so trying to understand and contextualise the circumstances in which they lived was difficult. The imam shared his thoughts, views, and knowledge with a clear motivation to support this review and was both honest and open regarding the many issues and challenges people in his congregation were facing, as well as remaining sensitive to the decision made by the family for privacy. The imam said his mosque regularly had an attendance of 400+ worshipers; made up from 48 different nationalities. He described his role as an imam of a large, diverse congregation; and said it was challenging due to the many different and diverse views. He said that his approach to deal with different views and cultures is to maintain a strong focus upon the teachings of the Quran, to support learning by general themes rather than specific situations, and ensure he is not swayed by opinion and individual circumstances.
- 6.2 The imam said he knew Tamana and her family as they all attended the mosque in

Town A. He conducted the funeral service upon Tamana's death and said that her death had a profound impact upon the young people of the congregation. He described how it had spread fear amongst the younger children (teenagers) and said that he had seen many young people take time off school to attend the funeral. He also said that it was a difficult time for young girls affected by the death of Tamana and the circumstances in which she had died. He said he did not know the perpetrator Shamas but was aware of the circumstances of the case and in his opinion the death had occurred because of a family feud. This family feud extended back into Afghanistan, where the families had originated. In his opinion people arriving in the UK from Afghanistan were escaping horrendous and dangerous circumstances and that as Muslims their faith could often be based upon custom rather than the teachings of the Quran. Afghans now living in the UK were often first-generation Muslims and their approach and views differed from those of 2<sup>nd</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> generation Muslims within his congregations. He said that in Afghanistan family honour, in some cases, was more important than the teachings of the Quran. He said he viewed education of the wider population in Afghanistan as the most important area of development, this could transform the lives of the people and replace the customs and dangerous prejudice that currently existed.

- 6.3. The imam explained that young children up to the age of 13 were taught their faith within the mosque, all Muslim parents had a duty to teach their children to read the Quran in Arabic, pray in Arabic, and to educate them in the ways of Islam. Once they were over the age of 13 continuing this education became more complex as there was currently no formal structure to continue this within his particular mosque.
- 6.4. The imam said that engaging with Afghan Muslims in his congregation was in his opinion difficult. They come from a war-torn country, and in his experience were 1st generation families with generally little or no education, he described them as being from tribal backgrounds coming to the UK to get a life and a job. He said that engaging with the 2<sup>nd</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> generation Muslims in his congregation was far easier. He felt that a mosque should be more than just a place to worship and that it could offer more to its congregation education and support regarding many of the issues they face. He was restricted in what he could do due to a lack of space, but he spoke positively about the opportunities that new facilities in his mosque would offer in bringing groups together outside of Friday worship. For him he hoped this could bridge the gaps between the differing nationalities. He felt one of the challenges for the Muslim faith was that the 2<sup>nd</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> generations are demanding relationships outside of their nationality and do not see this in conflict with their faith. This view is supported in the Quran. However, traditional values and customs are not easily changed, and this is particularly complex when extended families remain influential and living in significantly different circumstances.
- 6.5. We know that Tamana visited her old school 2 weeks before her death and met with the Head of Year 13. It is reported that she appeared well and displayed nothing out of the ordinary during the meeting. No issues of concern were expressed or felt at the time. The meeting and discussions focused on the university applications and did not

lead into any conversations of a more personal nature. The Head of Year 13 felt confident that Tamana would have spoken to her if she had wanted to share something, but also acknowledged that this was less likely if it related to any personal issues or relationship.

6.6 It was clear that Tamana was highly regarded at the school by all those who knew her. One member of staff said,

"The world is a much sadder place without Tamana and her dreams"

In her application for a place at university to study law Tamana wrote that she was passionate about law as she was a firm believer in the justice system. She said she wanted to advocate for vulnerable people and empower them to have their voices heard. Tamana ended her personal statement with some powerful words. She said,

"I originally come from Afghanistan where the notion of law and abiding it is afar distant reality for people, where usually vulnerable people's rights are stamped upon by the rich and powerful individuals. Similarly, in that society women are seen as second-class citizens where further and higher education will only be available to a few who face the social stigma, challenges, and threats. I therefore want to study and send a message that everything is achievable and possible despite all the challenges. I am sure every dream can become a reality with hard work and that is something I am ready to take on."

6.7. In seeking to add context and some understanding of the background and embedded cultural values and beliefs that Tamana and her family would have experienced whilst living in Afghanistan, it is useful to consider some additional background information. This detail gives a backdrop of the lived experience that Tamana had until she was 12 years old and moved to the UK. A strict Regime had been imposed upon the Afghan people, and this was in particular impactive on women and girls.

Valentine M. Moghadem (see Glossary & explanation of terms) in an essay entitled, Fundamentalism and the woman question in Afghanistan, presents a picture of life in Afghanistan. She says,

Historically the population of Afghanistan has been fragmented into myriad ethnic, linguistic, religious, kin based, and regional groupings. One of the few commonalities in this diverse country is Islam, Afghan Islam is a unique combination of practices and precepts from Sharia and tribal custom.

Afghan nationalism properly speaking, is at best incipient in that concept of nation state or of a national identity is absent from much of the population, during the country's most recent history, the fragmented groupings composed warring factions. Battles were fought primarily over land and water, and sometimes over women and honour and usually to exhibit sheer power.

The 1970's saw a rise in women's education, faculty in the universities, and

representation in the Parliament. The year 1978 saw the rise to power of the PDPA (Peoples Democratic Party of Afghanistan) It is during this time that rapid social and economic change took place and mass literacy of men and women was introduced. Massive land reform programs, along with the abolition of bride prices and the raising of bride ages to 16 was introduced. The speed of social change caused difficulties within some of the tribal rural regions and reports of harassment and shootings of women in western clothing reported. During this era women were employed in significant numbers in universities, private corporations, the airlines and as doctors and nurses.

Additionally, Huma Ahmed-Ghosh wrote (A History of Women in Afghanistan: Lessons learnt for the future or yesterdays and tomorrow).

In 1992 the Mujahideen took over Kabul and transitioned Afghanistan to an Islamic State. According to the US Department of State (1995) "In 1992 women were increasingly precluded from Public Service. In conservative areas in 1994, many women appeared in public only if dressed in a complete head to toe garment with a mesh covered opening for their eyes" This was only to be the start of apartheid towards women. Later in 1996 under a consortium of nations (USA, Pakistan, Iran and Saudi Arabia) supported the Taliban to counter the mismanaged politics and unexpected brutalities of the Mujahideen. An initial sense of relief was short lived and soon the Taliban set up a regime to control and monitor women's behavior. For women this meant no longer being allowed to go outside unless to buy food and then only when accompanied by mahram (male relative) Women had to wear the burqa and no makeup or fancy shoes. Women and girls were forbidden to go to school nor visit male doctors.

This period of change in the 1970s while attempting to improve women's status were not only unsuccessful but led to violent and fundamentalist backlashes by subsequent governments. In this period tribal leaders who objected to the redefining of women by state and the diminution of their authority initiated the disruption of the modernisation process.

(Huma Ahmed-Ghosh) see Glossary and Explanation of Terms

According to a <u>2010 mortality survey</u> carried out by the ministry of health in Afghanistan.

- 53% of Women in the 25 49 age group were married by the age of 18 years.
- 12% of Afghan girls aged 15 19 became pregnant or gave birth.
- 47% of the deaths of women aged 20 24 related to pregnancy.
- 1 Afghan women died every 2 hours because of pregnancy

In November 2017 <u>Georgetown Institution for Women</u>, Peace and Security. ranked Afghanistan as one of the worst countries for women.

# 7. Analysis

- 7.1 Evidence and information available to the review panel indicate that Tamana may have been a victim of domestic abuse at the hands of Shamas prior to the events that led to her death. Although there is no evidence available to suggest Shamas had been previously physically violent towards Tamana, a retrospective view of the evidence presented does suggest that Tamana was a victim of domestic abuse through coercion and control. During the police investigation some family members said they had concerns about Shamas, and that he had displayed some aggressive tendencies. Shortly after the marriage there is evidence that shows Shamas made threats towards family members in an attempt to persuade Tamana into moving to Town B and control her future. There is very limited information to inform to what extent he knew of Tamana's plans to go to university and her future career ambitions, and her request for birth control. It is unfortunate that family members did not feel able to contribute to the review so that these issues could have been explored further, but it is fair to assume that these issues were central to the argument that ultimately resulted in the brutal attack and her death. The incident in Town B involving the sexual assault of a female in a night club also raises concerns regarding his character, but the case was not pursued due to the victim declining to support a prosecution and limited records were available to review.
- 7.2 It is difficult to fully understand the part culture played in Tamana's family life. However, from the information provided by agencies, through the police investigation, and the views of the imam, culture was clearly a key factor in many of the decisions made affecting the life of Tamana. An overview of this is provided by the imam who highlights the different lifestyles and values of Muslim families within his congregation. The imam presented a picture that defined Afghan culture as being based upon the religious culture within the country from which they came, as opposed to religious belief. His view being that a lack of education and tribal practice often directed decisions, not the teachings of the Quran.
- 7.3 As evidenced during the police investigation, the influence of extended family members living in Afghanistan appears apparent. Evidence provided suggests Shamas was influenced by his father in Afghanistan and based some of his decisions and views upon his father's guidance. Text messaging from Shamas to Tamana suggests that his father's advice was directive, inflexible, and lacked any understanding or appreciation of what his son or daughter-in-law's lives, and circumstances were in the UK. It does seem that these views were based upon practice at that time in Afghanistan relating to the relationship between men and women, the dominant role of a husband in a marriage, and the expectations of how a woman should behave after marriage. Shamas was said to express his view that women should not work, or study and he did not want Tamana to do these things. This is clearly in contrast to everything that Tamana believed in and wanted for herself and her future. Tamana was a young woman whose faith was strong and central to her life. She followed the teachings of the Quran and dressed in the traditional way as was the culture of her family. She respected her parents and clearly sought and valued the view of her father which

influenced her own decision making. At school she spoke positively about being a Muslim and staff observed that she followed religious festivals in keeping with her faith. Tamana was also influenced by her life in the UK. She valued education and the opportunities it presented. She embraced the more liberal culture and became ambitious for her own future. Tamana wrote about her desire to support change for oppressed people which included Afghan women. It is not too far a leap to think that if her views and aspirations were openly expressed to Shamas and others from the traditional Afghan community, that this would have caused disagreement, conflict, even anger, as well as engendering—some feelings of dishonour. This would have presented a difficulty for her parents with regards to the views of extended family members. It is believed that a clash of cultures emerged, and this was a contributory factor to the difficulties Tamana had in trying to balance her own aspirations with that of her extended family.

- 7.4 During the 4-year engagement both Shamas and Tamana were developing their own plans outside the expectation of their families, and these did not revolve around them being together. In the lead up to the wedding accounts provided within the police investigation describe Shamas as becoming increasingly volatile in his demands for Tamana to move to Town B. Inevitably this could have driven them further apart and increase the animosity between them. The information available makes clear that this was an arranged marriage, and both Tamana and Shamas agreed to it. Prior to the wedding Tamana's father attempted to stop it. This was because of the concerns he had about the suitability of Shamas to be Tamana's husband, and his increasing aggression shown towards other family members. This action would have been unpopular within the extended family and demonstrates how concerned he was for her safety. His closeness to Tamana and his knowledge of her ambition for a future career suggests that he knew of the conflict and difficulties that lay ahead. In spite of this he was unable to stop the wedding and it seems he was overruled by other family members in Afghanistan.
- 7.5 It is clear from the reports provided about Tamana's education that she enjoyed school. She guickly developed her abilities in a new and very different country and culture to the one she had come from in Afghanistan. Not only could Tamana not speak English when she started school, but it can also be assumed that due to the lack of educational opportunities in Afghanistan for girls, that she had received little to no formal education. Tamana came from a background where the education of girls and women was not allowed. She was a bright intelligent girl and wanted to grow, develop and learn, and it was evident to her teachers that she had thought through and developed ambitions for the future. Additionally, her family, and in particularly her father, was very supportive of her ambitious future. He was clearly involved, together with Tamana, in discussing and shaping her decisions and choices in both education and career. This in contrast to the life he had lived in Afghanistan and demonstrated his support, forward thinking, and desire for Tamana to achieve her dreams. Information provided to the police from Zabih shows that Shamas did not share this view and felt that Tamana should not be concentrating upon an education or career.

- 7.6 Tamana's examination results were excellent and she was rightly pleased. They reflected the hard work and dedication displayed by her, and also showed the effort school staff had demonstrated in helping her achieve so much in such a short time. Tamana rarely spoke about her home life to staff at school, and without information from friends at school it is difficult to know if she discussed this with anyone. The review identified two incidents at school that gave an insight to Tamana's life outside of school. The first relating to a conversation she had together with a teacher about her marriage to Shamas. The second being her application to university to study law. In this application she outlines her desire to change the lives for women in Afghanistan and to challenge and stand up for women's rights. In particularly she wrote "this difference could affect my own life or even things that happen in the world" and "I want to cross boundaries that I come across that could stop me from going forward". With the benefit of hindsight both of these examples could have been explored with her, and may have provided an opportunity to identify how Tamana felt about the situation of her marriage. Although in this case the marriage appears not to have been forced, speaking to her about it could have provided an insight as to the additional pressures emerging for Tamana around her future aspirations. The fact that she did not take up the university placement, but then later returned to the school to make further applications, did provide an opportunity to discuss what happened last time and what would be different this time. Also exploring her statement and the very powerful words she had written, could also have been an opportunity to have discussed with her whether she too was experiencing any challenges, or felt any sense of oppression in her own life.
- 7.7 Whilst we know her to be a private young woman and respectful of her faith and culture, we also know she would speak out if she did not agree. The circumstances of this review have not afforded us this opportunity of real insight, but we can imagine the very real and growing difficulties that Tamana was facing in trying to balance her own aspirations and desires for her future life, with those expectations of her family, extended family members and that of her new husband Shamas.
- The review of the chronology shows that Shamas was well supported by services in Town B. He had regular contact with key workers who supported him in education and provision of both supported and independent living accommodation. There is limited information about any contact he had with Tamana or his uncle Aris who were living in Town A. The reports provided showed that in 2012 over a six-month period Shamas made 3 separate attempts to move to Town A. It is unclear why and to whom he referred when he stated he had friends in Town A. However, this was a short time after Tamana, her mother and siblings had arrived from Afghanistan and it may be assumed that he was attempting to move in to live with them as he had in Afghanistan. Although Shamas claimed at the point of entry into the UK that his father had been killed, later information provided showed his father was still alive and living in Afghanistan. Further information showed that Shamas was in contact with him.
- 7.9 In 2016 Shamas obtained vaccinations enabling him to travel to Afghanistan with the intention of visiting his father and brother. Information from the investigation into

Tamana's death showed the level of contact Shamas had with his father, and also demonstrated the level of involvement his father had in his life, which was significant. It also demonstrated the influence he had over the decisions being made around the future lives of both Tamana and Shamas. At times the language used by Shamas's father with regards to the wider family, stoked the growing aggression and animosity between Aris and Shamas. The life Shamas had built in Town B was established, and he had become successful in keeping a regular job and buying his home through the local authorities right to buy scheme. It is clear that upon being married to Tamana he was keen to move back to Town B but was prevented through concerns Tamana's family had over his attitude and aggression. Within the relationship between Tamana and Shamas this was a point that was regularly the subject of conflict and argument.

- 7.10 There are moments outlined within the chronology that provide evidence of Tamana and Shamas being in a good relationship. There is evidence of ongoing contact between them both by phone and text, and they both accepted their marriage as the will of their combined families. In planning a future together Tamana applied for housing securing a flat through a private rental agreement. It appears the conflict about their future was influenced by traditional practice and custom derived through a history of Afghan practice and took no account of how living within a UK culture had upon both of them.
- Tamana suffered from a vitamin D deficiency. This was identified by her GP and considered to have been caused by her cultural choice of dress and her diet. This in Tamana's community is not uncommon but is easily managed by regular exposure to the sun and supplements. The GP practice arranged regular appointments to check her condition and progress of improvement. A consequence of this condition was that she suffered from severe joint pain. Within the chronology are numerous occasions where she presented to both hospital and GP with severe pains in her body. In the month of her death Tamana contacted primary care on six separate occasions. Of particular note was an injury to her lower back which had previously been treated as a suspected broken vertebra, but upon closer examination was found to have been caused by the lack of vitamin D. In Late 2018 and within a couple of weeks before Tamana's death she made 3 separate calls to health services within a period of 6 days. Later in the same month Tamana contacted her GP requesting an implant for birth control and stating she did not wish to use the pill. She was referred to family planning and an appointment made. Tamana's reason for requesting an implant are not known. However, in considering her ambition to attend university, her marriage to Shamas, and the expectations upon her as a woman and wife in an Afghan culture, this may have been an attempt to covertly ensure she did not become pregnant. It is fair to say that the number of times Tamana contacted and accessed health services during this period was high, but it is difficult to put any inference upon this as she had reasons for all the contacts. However, looking at this within the wider context, and with hindsight, it could pose the question that she was wanting more questions to be asked of her, and given the opportunity may have shared some concerns with a professional outside of the family network.

# 8. Conclusions

- 8.1. Information gathered whilst undertaking this review demonstrates that Tamana and her family were private people and did not readily discuss their personal lives outside their own family network. This has meant that limited information has been available to the agencies involved in this review. Combined with the family's decision not to engage, although understandable, has meant that there seems like many unanswered questions. It is always hoped that such reviews as this can provide a rich and full picture of the lives and circumstances leading up to an individual's death, but unfortunately in the case of Tamana's untimely and horrific death this has not been possible. What we do know is that Tamana's ability and ambition has never been in doubt, and the school reports describe her as a vibrant, intelligent and ambitious young woman. However, the complexities of her life through cultural expectations are not fully understood, and the opportunity to overlay them against her ambition and ability have not fully been realised within this report. From the information provided and the valuable assistance of the imam and panel members, this report has reflected on the evidence, the broader background information, and the views of those with similar lived experience to Tamana. This allowed for the identification of lessons to be learned and recommendations with the sole motivation of assisting in protecting young women like Tamana in the future.
- 8.2 Information available to the review panel demonstrate that Tamana was a victim of domestic abuse before the actions that led to her death. There is information that suggests Shamas tried to influence the decisions Tamana was making regarding her life. Zabih, in his evidence to police, stated that he believed Shamas wanted to control Tamana and he had told him that he did not want her to either work or undertake further study. It is therefore fair to conclude that coercion and control, clear elements of domestic abuse, can be attributed to Shamas' behavior towards Tamana.
- 8.3 Honour based violence is defined by the National Police Chiefs Council as being;
  - "An incident or crime involving violence, threats of violence, intimidation, coercion or abuse (including psychological, physical, sexual, financial or emotional abuse), which has or may have been committed to protect the honour of an individual, family and/or community for alleged or perceived breaches of the family and/or community's code of behaviour"
  - 8.4 On this basis, and applying it to the circumstances of Tamana's death, the definition of an honour-based killing has been fulfilled. Although the evidence of admission is not available, the test is proven by the inclusion of the term "which has or may have been...". In considering all of the information provided within this review, it could be concluded that Shamas killed Tamana because he believed he was protecting the honour of his family. What is not known is the role, if any, the wider family played in Tamana's death. It does however appear that Shamas' father was very directive of his son, and in particular what was expected of him, as Tamana's husband, should she not obey his instructions.

- 8.5 Evidence provided in this review demonstrates that the cause of Tamana's death was not related to faith or religion. It related to tribal and cultural beliefs surrounding honour, and the role and expectation of women within the family unit in Afghanistan. Although Tamana's father tried to stop the wedding as he was concerned for her safety, he did not feel it in his power to do so and would not go against the will of the family. On this occasion the sense of honour and duty, in following tribal customs ultimately led to Tamana's brutal death.
- The school Tamana attended was exemplary in providing an environment in which she could thrive. It is clear through the evidence provided that there was a collective feeling of pride in Tamana's academic achievements, and the sense of great loss at her horrific death. This review identified that Tamana did not share or confide in staff, but the panel felt confident that if she had raised any concerns that the school staff would have reacted supportively and appropriately. However, Tamana did provide some insights into her personal life and did share information about her forthcoming wedding and her passionate views within her statements about women's oppression. When she returned to the school to complete her second application this could have provided an ideal opportunity to further discuss with her why she did not take up the offer of a place to study law the previous year, what had changed to now make it possible, and whether she had any concerns about fulfilling this ambition.
- 8.7 Tamana had regular appointments with health care professionals, and all of these interactions were thorough, supportive and considered her wider needs in regard to her vitamin D deficiency. She benefited from ongoing appointments to monitor her condition and was provided with advice to try and counter the symptoms. However, In December 2018 Tamana made 6 separate contacts to Health Services, a visit to A&E, a call to Out of Hours, a visit to the GP and 3 calls to the GP surgery, in the space of 13 days. This related in the main to her recurring back pain. The back pain she referred to was linked to the investigations 2 years previously that had identified her low levels of vitamin D, although Tamana presented this as due to a fractured vertebra. The notes presented within the chronology demonstrate a difference in Tamana's view from that of the original diagnosis. It is fair to conclude that all these factors combined could have triggered a greater level of professional curiosity, and whilst accepting this view is speculative and borne from the opportunity of hindsight, it may have provided the opportunity for Tamana to share any concerns she had about her welfare.
- 8.8 This review presents the picture of a young Muslim woman living in an environment where there is a clash of cultures. We can assume that Tamana was experiencing a level of inner turmoil in her attempts to keep her family happy, in respecting the traditional values and customs of her upbringing in Afghanistan, whilst also balancing her own now lived experience of being educated and exposed to a very different culture in the UK. Tamana developed her own very advanced aspirations, voiced her ambitions and worked hard to achieve these. We also know that she did not give up easily and was able to challenge certain aspects of her life when others were trying to make decisions for her. We note this in particular regarding her second application to

university and her attempts to delay moving in with Shamas in the final days before her brutal death. Tamana did not directly share her thoughts or concerns with anyone. In meeting with the imam, his views were strongly felt that there was a gap in the support offered to young Muslims in his community once the structured teaching ends at 13 years. Up to the age of 13 years children are taught the ways of the Quran at the mosque, but following this support and guidance is provided by parents. For Tamana we do not know if she had any friends or network outside of the family where she could safely and freely discuss her situation, aspirations, dreams, fears and concerns, with a person who may understand and have a similar lived experience to her. Included for reference are two of the many organisations that exist which provide information, offer support and campaign for the rights of people in similar circumstances to Tamana.

Muslim Women's Network UK. https://www.mwnuk.co.uk

Muslim Youth Helpline. <a href="https://www.myh.org.uk">https://www.myh.org.uk</a>

Further details regarding these organisations and how to contact them are contained within *Appendix B* at the end of the document.

- 8.9 Agencies from Town B demonstrated a good level of engagement and care in supporting Shamas upon his arrival in the UK in 2007 and the subsequent years until he was closed to Leaving Care Services in 2013. However, what is now known is that he was in fact an adult when he came to the UK. Had this fact been known his application may have been refused as his claims of escaping Afghanistan were not accepted. It could be concluded that he would not have been accepted into the UK.
- 8.10 This review identifies good practice with respect to the support and care shown to Tamana during her time at school. Her arrival in the UK, not able to speak English, coming from a country in turmoil and continuous war, would have meant a difficult beginning for any child. The level of attainment achieved by Tamana was outstanding and the staff and school must be praised for the work they did in supporting Tamana to realise her potential.

# 9 Lessons to be learnt

9.1 This review identified a disconnect between Tamana's life at school and her religious and cultural upbringing. Awareness and understanding of the cultural norms and potential pressures Tamana was facing was not established within the school network. As no issues were raised this didn't present as an overt problem, but had staff been aware of the potential diverse cultural differences and had there been knowledge of support groups and organisations that can offer information and advice, this would have provided for the opportunity of a different conversation. The imam also identified that there was a gap in the active support the mosque provides for young Muslims and hoped to develop support groups to address this in the future. If there had been a link between the mosque and the school this could have provided an opportunity for

- discussion and for staff to gain a wider understanding of the issues of not just the Muslim faith, but of current issues regarding culture and custom.
- 9.2 The cultural influences identified within this review are not only significant but pivotal factors that contributed to the death of Tamana. Her death was an honour killing believed to have been carried out due to her unwillingness to give up on her own ambition and comply with the cultures and values that existed outside the UK in Afghanistan. In learning lessons, it seems that agency staff were not equipped, confident or willing to speak about, or question aspects of Tamana's life. We know that the fear of being accused of at worst racism or at least being judgmental, can lead to a lack of questioning or professional curiosity. This has been identified before and was a feature in the report following the child sexual exploitation cases in Rotherham. An understanding of different cultures, forced marriages and honour based violence, would assist all practitioners in being better equipped to question and sensitively explore aspects of people's culture. In equal measures front line staff need to be supported by their line managers and senior managers when identifying such issues or areas of concern.
- 9.3 We know that domestic abuse and in particular the elements of coercion and control were emerging features of the relationship between Shamas and Tamana. This may have initially been identified as social norms by some within many relationships, communities and some traditional cultures. However, it is important not to conflate the two and ensure that it is dealt with as domestic abuse appropriately under national guidelines and legislation.
- 9.4. This review identified that traditional practices surrounding honour were present in the actions and communications leading to Tamana's death. It is unlikely that this knowledge would have been apparent to any of the services that came into contact with Tamana prior to her death and has only become evident from the subsequent investigation. In understanding and assisting practitioners and communities to identify incidents and deal with the harm caused by honour based crime a robust investigation of the facts leading to the offence being committed should to be carried out. A flagging system within national crime recording processes allows all crimes linked to honour to be recorded as such. This review identified that in this case the recorded crime did not flag the link to honour. This omission is not uncommon and is particularly prevalent in more serious crime offences such as murder. In a bid to understand the extent of honour based crimes committed, a fuller review of the facts should be undertaken, then in circumstances where honour is shown to be a factor the report flagged following national crime recording principals. Only by doing this will a clear picture as to the extent of honour based crimes in the UK be understood.
- 9.5 The panel has outlined 4 recommendations based upon the findings of the IMRs and reports submitted.

# 10. Recommendations

# 10.1 The review panel makes the following 4 recommendations from this DHR:

	Recommendation	Organisation
1	Schools should be supported where appropriate, with understanding and recognising cultures and customs which may lead to family conflict, honour based violence and domestic abuse for students from minority communities. This should include support regarding how to appropriately respond.	Kent Education
2	Primary health care staff should be trained in understanding and recognising cultures and customs which may lead to family conflict, honour based violence and domestic abuse for patients from minority communities. This should include support regarding how to appropriately respond.	Health Care Kent
3	Raise awareness of the supportive services available to young people from different cultural and religious backgrounds through a system of information sharing.	Kent Community Safety Partnership
4	To raise awareness of crime recording flagged markers for honour based offences.	Kent Police

# Kent & Medway Domestic Homicide Review Victim – Tamana

# Terms of Reference - Part 1

# 1. Background

- 1.1 In December 2018, Police Officers attended an address in town A. They discovered the body of Tamana lying on the kitchen floor. A knife and a large amount of blood was also present. She was the victim of a ferocious and sustained knife attack in her kitchen resulting in numerous wounds.
- 1.2 Shamas was arrested for murder and was subsequently charged and remanded in custody.
- 1.3 In accordance with Section 9 of the Domestic Violence, Crime and Victims Act 2004, a Kent and Medway Domestic Homicide Review (DHR) Core Panel meeting was held on 29<sup>th</sup> January 2019. It confirmed that the criteria for a DHR have been met.
- 1.4 That agreement has been ratified by the Chair of the Kent Community Safety Partnership (under a Kent & Medway CSP agreement to conduct DHRs jointly) and the Home Office has been informed. In accordance with established procedure this review will be referred to as DHR 32.

# 2. The Purpose of the DHR

- 2.1 The purpose of this review is to:
  - establish what lessons are to be learned from the domestic homicide of Tamana regarding the way in which local professionals and organisations work individually and together to safeguard victims;
  - ii. identify clearly what those lessons are, both within and between agencies, how and within what timescales they will be acted on, and what is expected to change as a result;
  - iii. apply these lessons to service responses, including changes to inform national and local policies and procedures as appropriate;
  - iv. prevent domestic violence and homicide and improve service responses for all domestic violence and abuse victims and their children by developing a coordinated multi-agency approach to ensure that domestic abuse is identified and responded to effectively at the earliest opportunity;
  - v. contribute to a better understanding of the nature of domestic violence and abuse; and

vi. Highlight good practice.

# 3. The Focus of the DHR

- 3.1 This review will establish whether any agency or agencies identified possible and/or actual domestic abuse that may have been relevant to the death of Tamana.
- 3.2 If such abuse took place and was not identified, the review will consider why not, and how such abuse can be identified in future cases.
- 3.3 If domestic abuse was identified, this review will focus on whether each agency's response to it was in accordance with its own and multi-agency policies, protocols and procedures in existence at the time. In particular, if domestic abuse was identified, the review will examine the method used to identify risk and the action plan put in place to reduce that risk. This review will also take into account current legislation and good practice. The review will examine how the pattern of domestic abuse was recorded and what information was shared with other agencies.

# 4. DHR Methodology

- 4.1 Independent Management Reviews (IMRs) must be submitted using the templates current at the time of completion.
- 4.2 This review will be based on IMRs provided by the agencies that were notified of or had contact with Tamana in circumstances relevant to domestic abuse, or to factors that could have contributed towards domestic abuse, e.g. alcohol or substance misuse. Each IMR will be prepared by an appropriately skilled person who has not any direct involvement with Tamana, and who is not an immediate line manager of any staff whose actions are, or may be, subject to review within the IMR.
- 4.3 Each IMR will include a chronology, a genogram (if relevant), and analysis of the service provided by the agency submitting it. The IMR will highlight both good and poor practice, and will make recommendations for the individual agency and, where relevant, for multi-agency working. The IMR will include issues such as the resourcing/workload/supervision/support and training/experience of the professionals involved.
- 4.4 Each agency required to complete an IMR must include all information held about Tamana and Shamas from 1<sup>st</sup> January 2011 to Tamana's death in December 2018. If any information relating to Tamana as the victim(s), or Shamas being a perpetrator, or vice versa, of domestic abuse before 1<sup>st</sup> January 2011 comes to light, that should also be included in the IMR.
- 4.5 Information held by an agency that has been required to complete an IMR, which is relevant to the homicide, must be included in full. This might include for example: previous incidents of violence (as a victim or perpetrator), alcohol/substance misuse, or mental health issues relating to Tamana and/or Shamas. If the information is not relevant to the circumstances or nature of the homicide, a brief précis of it will be sufficient (e.g. in 2010, X was cautioned for an offence of shoplifting).

- 4.6 Any issues relevant to equality, i.e age, disability, gender reassignment, marriage and civil partnership, pregnancy and maternity, race, religion or belief, sex, sexual orientation must be identified. If none are relevant, a statement to the effect that these have been considered must be included.
- 4.7 When each agency that has been required to submit an IMR does so in accordance with the agreed timescale, the IMRs will be considered at a meeting of the DHR Panel and an overview report will then be drafted by the Chair of the panel. The draft overview report will be considered at a further meeting of the DHR Panel and a final, agreed version will be submitted to the Chair of Kent CSP.

# 5. Specific Issues to be addressed

- 5.1 Specific issues that must be considered, and if relevant, addressed by each agency in their IMR are:
  - i. Were practitioners sensitive to the needs of Tamana and Shamas, and were they knowledgeable about potential indicators of domestic abuse and aware of what to do if they had concerns about a victim or perpetrator? Was it reasonable to expect them, given their level of training and knowledge, to fulfil these expectations?
  - ii. Did the agency have policies and procedures for Domestic Abuse, Stalking and Harassment (DASH) risk assessment and risk management for domestic abuse victims or perpetrators, and were those assessments correctly used in the case of Tamana and/or Shamas (as applicable)? Did the agency have policies and procedures in place for dealing with concerns about domestic abuse? Were these assessment tools, procedures and policies professionally accepted as being effective? Were Tamana and/or Shamas subject to a MARAC or other multi-agency forum?
  - iii. Did the agency comply with domestic violence and abuse protocols agreed with other agencies including any information sharing protocols?
  - iv. What were the key points or opportunities for assessment and decision making in this case? Do assessments and decisions appear to have been reached in an informed and professional way?
  - v. Did actions or risk management plans fit with the assessment and decisions made? Were appropriate services offered or provided, or relevant enquiries

made in the light of the assessments, given what was known or what should have been known at the time?

vi. When, and in what way, were the victim's wishes and feelings ascertained and considered? Is it reasonable to assume that the wishes of the victim should have been known? Was the victim informed of options/choices to make informed decisions? Were they signposted to other agencies?

- vii. Was anything known about the perpetrator? For example, were they being managed under MAPPA? Were there any injunctions or protection orders that were, or previously had been, in place?
- viii. Had the victim disclosed to any practitioners or professionals and, if so, was the response appropriate?
- ix. Was this information recorded and shared, where appropriate?
- x. Were procedures sensitive to the ethnic, cultural, linguistic and religious identity of the victim, the perpetrator and their families? Was consideration for vulnerability and disability necessary? Were any of the other protected characteristics relevant in this case?
- xi. Were senior managers or other agencies and professionals involved at the appropriate points?
- xii. Are there other questions that may be appropriate and could add to the content of the case? For example, was the domestic homicide the only one that had been committed in this area for a number of years?
- xiii. Are there ways of working effectively that could be passed on to other organisations or individuals?
- xiv. Are there lessons to be learned from this case relating to the way in which an agency or agencies worked to safeguard Tamana and promote their welfare, or the way it identified, assessed and managed the risks posed by Shamas? Where can practice be improved? Are there implications for ways of working, training, management and supervision, working in partnership with other agencies and resources?
- xv. Did any staff make use of available training?
- xvi. Did any restructuring take place during the period under review and is it likely to have had an impact on the quality of the service delivered?
- xvii. How accessible were the services to Tamana and Shamas (as applicable)?
- xviii. What were the circumstances of Shamas's entry to the UK?
- xix. What information is known about the injury to Shamas's face at the time of his entry to the UK?
- xx. Was the school attended by Tamana aware of the fact that she was engaged to be married?
- xxi. What was the impact of Tamana's intention to apply for a place at university, and were school staff aware of any potential impact of her application?
- xxii. To liaise with Immigration services to ascertain whether any detail of Shamas's entry is relevant particularly with regards to an eye injury upon his arrival in the UK.

# 6. Document Control

- 6.1 The two parts of these Terms of Reference form one document, on which will be marked the version number, author and date of writing/amendment.
- 6.2 The document is subject to change as a result of new information coming to light during the review process, and as a result of decisions and agreements made by the DHR Panel. Where changes are made to the document, the version number, date and author will be amended accordingly, and that version will be used subsequently.
- 6.3 A record of the version control is included in the appendix to the document.

# **UK Organisations supporting Muslim Women & Girls**

# Muslim Women's Network UK (MWNUK)

Connecting voices for change.

MWNUK was formally established in 2003 to give independent advice to Government on issues relating to Muslim Women and Public Policy. It was set up to;

- To talk openly talk about difficult issues that are often to swept under the carpet only when they are discussed that they can be tackled
- Ensure the concerns and voices of Muslim women and girls reach decision makers
- To research and highlight the lived experiences of Muslim women
- To inform Muslim women and girls about their rights and the support and help that exists
- To promote Muslim female role models

They are contactable through their website, Facebook, and twitter.

MWN Helpline. 0800 999 5786 & 0303 999 5786

# **Muslim Youth Helpline**

Muslim Youth Helpline (MYH) was set up in 2001 and provides anonymous and confidential advice and support. They are contactable via their website at <a href="mailto:info@myh.org.uk">info@myh.org.uk</a> or twitter and Facebook.

Phone Number 0808 808 2008

# **Engagement with Muslim Young People in Modern UK**

# Aim of Survey

This is part of a Domestic Homicide review (DHR) into the Murder of a young Muslim female to learn lessons from the death so that we can share these with different agencies.

The narrative of each review should articulate the life through the eyes of the victim, and by talking to those with common links and aspirations we may identify how things could be improved for the future. The final report will reflect a wider view than just one individual and that by participating you will be contributing to reducing the risk of incidents occurring in the future and lead to a better anticipation of risk by statutory services such as Police, social services, education.

#### **Respondents:**

There were 31 respondents to the survey.

### Age:

Responses were recorded from people 18 years and older. No definition of what is "young" was given but six respondents were over 25.

Age	Number of
	Respondents
18	6
19	5
20	5
22	6
23	3
25+	6
Total	31

# Gender:

22 Females 9 males

More than two thirds of responses were from women.

#### Area of Residence:

Numbers in each area cover Ashford, Canterbury, Folkestone, Maidstone, Tunbridge Wells, Medway and Gravesend. Also Outside of Kent.

#### Responses:

# 1) What does being Muslim mean to you?

The answers to this were around respect for others and supporting and helping others (Muslim and Non-Muslim). About honesty and leading a good life. Mention is made of the connection with other Muslims and the unity that brings and a feeling of safety. Connection with God and inner peace and God being Just was also highlighted.

# 2) What are your educational aspirations and are you able to fulfil these?

Aspirations mentioned all involve further education, either university or college. Almost all stated that they had been supported however there was one answer to the next question which showed frustration about not being able to choose education or work.

# 3) What are your views and/or experience on marriage?

There are a number of issues covered here, with a mixture of positive and negative experiences or expectations.

Some mention that they would marry for love and would have support to do so. Others state that arranged marriages are still common and some mention that they would not necessarily know if a marriage was forced as they learn their attitudes to marriage from their elders.

Many mention that it is for life and an agreement to spend it with one person and that there should not be relations before marriage and that it is a special relationship. Others highlight consent of parents is needed.

There is a suggestion that marriage gives respect.

One highlighted themselves as married at 13 years in a forced marriage and came to England as a refugee after being beaten. Safeguarding was in place. Another highlighted that due to their culture, Muslims would not come to police as it is shameful and another that there is a distrust of authorities due to experiences in home countries.

Inequality between the freedom men have compared to women to choose a partner was mentioned.

# 4) What issues concern you as a young Muslim in 2019 and what can be done to help? The responses to this question highlight three main issues:

- 1) Prejudice: There is concern for the attitude non-Muslims have to Muslims. There are two types of stereotypes highlighted:
  - a. the stereo type of young Muslim women and
  - b. the stereotype that because a small number of Muslims behave a certain way, then it means all do. This was not limited to terrorism but also in terms of traditions and cultural beliefs.

The terms hate crime and racism are both used to highlight concerns. The media are mentioned as contributing to these stereotypes and suggestions that more needs to be done to explain Muslim's beliefs and culture and educate society to break down these prejudices. Concern around the safety of young Muslim people was also highlighted.

- 2) More personal issues were also highlighted such as a lack of freedom to have their own voice and to be able to choose a profession and / or further education. Also LGBT issues, allowing sexual choice.
- 3) Opportunities to learn languages, understand Islamic teaching, awareness of services available in the community need to improve.
- 4) One response was extremely positive and highlighted no concerns and happy to be Muslim, had the support of the Mosque.

# 5) Would you be confident in reporting to the Police and/or authorities any concerns you may have? Can you please expand on your response?

Many stated that they would contact police. Some qualified this with the hope that even as a minority they would be taken seriously like anyone else.

One mentioned they would like to work for the Police.

At least one was definite that they would not report to the police/authorities. Another stated

that the misrepresentation of Muslims would deter them from reaching outside the community unless it was a serious incident.

Several thought that language barriers were a real concern which may lead to some not reporting. The concern was raised that more often than not the woman is blamed disproportionately in the community when things go wrong.

At least one mentioned that honour may impact on reporting, another stated it would depend on the situation.

# 6) What do you think in going well for you and why do you think this is?

Education and work are expressed as positives. Enjoyment of the freedom to walk around and have choice and opportunities.

The fact that there is a Mosque in the University town was highlighted as an advantage to be able to maintain their faith while studying.

# 7) Is there anything else you would like to add?

Some highlighted more awareness about Muslims is needed and more effort to engage the Muslim community. The current attitudes to Islamophobia were highlighted as a specific issue.

Concerns around pregnancy and expectation of children straight after marriage were stated. It was mentioned that if a woman who was studying fell pregnant she would be expected to withdraw from her education.

Many responses highlighted issues between old traditions and more modern approaches such as generations of the same family not living together and while attitudes are changing, shame can still be felt in the community. Other social issues such as once people start a family in a new country they can feel isolated, lack of services or access to services and a difficulty for people to avoid feeling segregated.

#### Summary

Despite the survey being circulated more than once to community contacts and groups, there was a limited response. However further one to ones and focus groups were arranged and the survey covered a sample of 31 respondents. Each response was important but the small response means no strong conclusions can be drawn. Due to the nature of focus groups, it is not possible to track the responses of one individual across all the questions in order to build up a picture of how their responses interrelate or whether they contradict themselves at times. However, this disadvantage is offset by the opportunity to ask further questions to responses and so obtain more detailed answers and explanations than may have been provided by a written survey. This report therefore shows a collective response rather than the individual's experience.

Responses were mixed as would be expected as an individual's experiences will always vary. Freedom and choice were mentioned frequently and appear valued. The importance of identifying as a Muslim was evident as was a desire for greater knowledge, understanding and acceptance between communities. The information provided is extremely limited but does suggest cultural differences in terms of marriage and children and education are a factor but not for all respondents.

# Additional overview provided by Kulbir Pasricha following survey collation via post, email, phone, 1-2-1s and focus groups.

This is to be read in conjunction with the above.

Faith is key to young Muslims growing up in Modern Britain. Via the one to ones and focus groups, it was apparent that Islam, attending the Mosque and families have an important role in the lives of young people. Engagement from agencies at the Mosque and through other

activities are limited but welcome by the young people to make them more aware of services available. Males and females are segregated at the Mosque for prayers therefore appropriate representation from services will enable full engagement. It is important for the services to be accessible by everyone and as such, there is a need to understand cultural norms to build bridges and community confidence. This would help understand the family set up, expectations on young people and how this meets but can also vary with the elder's expectations. It is also important to understand the different Islamic sects within the Muslim Community and the schools of thought. This was relevant when understanding intersect relationships and how these could be an aggravating factor in honour based abuse.

In terms of policing, there was mention of involvement with both uniformed officers and police staff at some key events and celebrations. Young people were keen to share their knowledge and felt it was important to include their views when making decisions for future services.

As per any engagement and communications, the suggestion is to ensure information is accessible in all languages, which will also ensure the older generation can be included where sometimes language can be a barrier. There was limited knowledge that the 101 service had language facilities.

A majority of those who engaged explained how the media could do more around positive messages around Islam. There was a view that the constant negative messages had an impact on increasing hate crime and isolating the communities.

There is a view that more awareness is required around the services available when seeking support or guidance around harmful practices in communities such as honour based abuse and Forced Marriages. There is a strong view that although there was some understanding around domestic abuse, the full extent of what constitutes domestic abuse was not known. There was some knowledge and understanding with the young people mainly from their own research. They hadn't noticed as much awareness and discussions around domestic abuse through education but would welcome this. They would not want to criminalise families and had limited knowledge around protection orders and their purpose. It was important to understand the concept of honour and shame as it is still engrained in cultural norms and some families. This is why it is important for agencies to understand cultural norms and possible barriers to accessing and reporting information. The young people were clear they had educational aspirations but there were variances in family support for this, more so for the females where there is an expectation around arranged marriages at a younger age.

In summary the young people were keen to be involved in the various services and they can shape this to be inclusive.

# **Glossary**

Abbreviation/Acronym	Explanation
DHR	Domestic Homicide Review
IMR	Independent Management Review
KCC	Kent County Council
GP	General Medical Practitioner
FLO	Family Liaison Officer
CSP	Community Safety Partnership
MARAC	Multi Agency Risk Assessment Conference
DAVSS	Domestic Abuse Victim Support Services. A community-based charity offering vital and practical support to anyone experiencing Domestic Abuse
DASH	Domestic Abuse Stalking & Harassment Risk Assessment toolkit
SIO	Senior Investigation Officer (Police)
NHS	National Health Service
UK	United Kingdom
GCSE	General Certificate of Secondary Education
YPSS	Young Peoples Support Services
BTEC	Business & Technology Education Council
A & E	Accident & Emergency (Hospital)
AQA	Assessment & Qualifications Alliance

The following is an explanation of terms that are used in the main body of the overview.

# **Shia Muslim**

Shia Muslims believe that just as a prophet is appointed by God alone, only God has the prerogative to appoint the successor to his prophet. They believe God chose Ali to be Muhammed's successor, infallible, the first caliph of Islam. Shia Muslims are in the majority in Iran, Iraq, Bahrain, Azerbaijan, and according to some estimates Yemen. There are also large Shia communities in Afghanistan, India, Kuwait, Lebanon, Pakistan, Qatar, Syria, Turkey, Saudi Arabia and the UAE.

# Ramadan

Ramadan is the ninth month in the Islamic Calendar, observed by Muslims world-wide as a month of fasting, prayer, reflection and community. It occurs every year usually from late April until the same time in May.

# Eid

Eid al-Fitr also called the "breaking of the fast" is a religious holiday to celebrate the end of Ramadan.

### Valentine M Moghada

Valentine M Moghada is a feminist scholar, sociologist, activist and author, whose work focuses on women in development, globalisation, feminist networks, and female employment in the Middle East.

#### Huma Ahmed-Ghosh

Dr Huma Ahmed-Ghosh is a professor in the department of Women's studies at San Diego State University. She is also on the Advisory Board of the Centre for Islamic and Arabic Studies and the Centre for Asia-Pacific studies. Her research focuses on women in Afghanistan, Muslim immigrant women to the USA and Islam and Feminism.

# Section 17 Children Act 1989

This act states that it is the general duty of every local authority to safeguard and promote the welfare of children within their area who are in need. And so far as is consistent with that duty, to promote upbringing of such children by their families.

# Harmful Practises

Harmful traditional practises are forms of violence which have been committed primarily against women and girls in certain communities and societies for so long that they are considered, or presented, by the perpetrators, as part of an acceptable cultural practise. The most common are forced or early marriages.

### Marriages overseas

The panel raised the question as to whether the marriage in Afghanistan would be registered in the UK and therefore legally binding. The Superintendent for Registrations in Kent was contacted and provided the following advice.

"There is no legal requirement to register a marriage in this country if married abroad. Some couples will still ask to marry in this country but this casts doubt on the validity of the previous marriage so many do not follow this process."

"If a couple, consider themselves as married and have a marriage certificate then this suffices the law for England and Wales for the couple to be legally married."